

**Media Editorial Policies on Human Rights Issues in Online Media
in Yogyakarta, Indonesia**

Senja Yustitia

Firly Annisa

Media Editorial Policies on Human Rights Issues in Online Media in Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Senja Yustitia

Firly Annisa

Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta

The trend of human rights violations in the digital era affects social life and the media as a space for discourses on human rights. Grounded upon the changing condition of the media in the digital era, two issues are addressed in the current study. First, how do human rights issues affect the stance of online media editorial departments, including their editorial policies in producing news? Second, what approaches do online media take to news production, particularly on privacy violations and freedom of expression? This study aims to acquire a comprehensive description of media content and editorial policies in producing news on human rights in the digital era. A qualitative study was conducted on local online media outlets in Yogyakarta, namely *Tribunjogja.com* and *Mojok.co*, from 2019 to 2024. We interviewed the media's editorial departments, qualitatively analyzed their news content, and carried out observations. We used concepts such as communication rights, thematic and episodic news, and deinstitutionalization to interpret the study's findings. The research findings show that each media outlet tried to respond to the situation of human rights by publishing news that tended to be episodic and comment-based reporting and writing. Incidents relating to violating privacy and freedom of expression were not perceived as a pattern or a part of a bigger series of events. Such practices can distort the public's ability to view human rights issues holistically while undermining the growth of space for criticism.

KEYWORDS: data privacy; digital era; freedom of expression; human rights; online media; media editorial policies

1. INTRODUCTION

The digital era has changed the public's way of life while also presenting vulnerabilities. The digital world provides newfound freedom to the public, including the ability to create narratives that were previously limited to elite or media institutions. Technology is even viewed as a tool to achieve the fulfilment of human rights (Donahoe 2014). This indirectly creates a much more egalitarian state of affairs but also disrupts established norms. As an example, attacks on privacy become more frequent and easily carried out. Additionally, due to technology, restrictions on individuals are also more likely to be enforced, especially by states or powerful groups against less powerful ones.

In the context of digital space, the phenomenon of human rights violations presented simply as episodic issues exacerbates the public's perception. Digital platforms, with their speed and virality focused algorithm, tend to present fragmented, sensational, or instant information often with insufficient contexts (Delfanti and Arvidsson 2019). This makes it easier for the public to become entrapped in temporary, fragmented narratives without being aware that human rights violations are frequently associated with broader state policies or socio-political power. When online media reports on human rights violations, it seems to be unassociated with the existing system. Digital space is therefore at risk of undermining public awareness, subsequently hindering collective efforts to promote sustainable and comprehensive policy change.

SAFEnet noted that with regards to digital rights in Indonesia there was an increase in the criminalization of expressions made by digital media users throughout 2019 (Juniarto 2020). Interestingly, this data indicates that the victims of violence were journalists and media organizations (Aditya and Krisiandi 2020). Data from Aliansi Jurnalis Independen (AJI), the Alliance of Independent Journalists, also revealed a similar trend. It reported that at least fourteen journalists and one media outlet were prosecuted under Undang-Undang Informasi dan Transaksi Elektronik (UU ITE), the Electronic Information and

Transaction Law, during the 2020–2021 period (CNN Indonesia 2021). Indonesia’s ITE Law has often been a subject of criticism as it restricts freedom of expression and opinion in public. This phenomenon reinforces the argument that individuals are not the only ones deemed vulnerable. The press, as an institution that provides space for freedom of expression and checks on power, also remains at risk.

The current qualitative study focuses on online media practices in Yogyakarta due to its complex human rights situation. In 2017, data from the Setara Institute ranked Yogyakarta the 6th lowest in terms of tolerance for diversity compared to other cities in Indonesia. Several media outlets also ranked Yogyakarta among the top ten most intolerant regions (Purba 2019). On the other hand, Yogyakarta is often labeled as a city of education and culture, which has a positive implication in contrast to its human rights situation (Rijaluzaman 2017). This study seeks to answer two research questions: **(1) How do online media editorial policies of Tribun Jogja.com and Mojok.co respond to issues of human rights in the digital era? (2) How do online media outlets of Tribun Jogja.com and Mojok.co produce news on human rights, specifically pertaining to issues of privacy violation and freedom of expression?**

2. EXPLORING THEORIES: FROM MEDIA COVERAGE, HUMAN RIGHTS, TO THE DIGITAL REVOLUTION

Multifaceted reporting and comprehensive policies are necessary due to the increasingly dynamic nature of human rights issues. For example, they encompass issues such as “privacy, freedom of expression, access to information, cyber security, and online discrimination” (Aziz et al. 2022, 38). The media as a non-state institution holds an interesting position. First, the media is a strategic space in human rights discourse (Brooten 2017). Second, the media plays a role in constructing the reality of human rights violations (Yustitia, Prajarto, and Irawanto 2023). In constructing the reality of human rights, the media can choose either episodic or thematic reporting formats with their

respective consequences for the public and their implications on human rights.

Thematic and episodic coverage are integral concepts to this research analysis. Episodic coverage is described as reporting that captures life as fragmented episodes, random events, or case studies (Bales 2005). Iyengar (1996) notes that episodic news portrays an issue within the context of a specific event, often in the form of illustrations. Meanwhile, thematic coverage presents a broader issue landscape, detailing the overarching trends and systems that contribute to particular issues (Bales 2005; Iyengar 1996). In issues of politics, for example, thematic framing can describe an issue in a more “abstract” manner “by placing them in some appropriate context.” As an example, in a report about poverty, the media can provide information about poverty trends and the consequences for public policy makers. Thematic framing typically provides background information along with a series of commentaries from various sources (Iyengar 1996, 62).

The media’s tendency to use easily produced episodic coverage is counterproductive to the state of information circulation in the digital era. Mancini (2020, 2022) argues that rapid circulation of knowledge and information creates a paradoxical situation in which there are greater opportunities to disseminate information, but strong actors, particularly authoritarian regimes, seek to control it. In the context of human rights coverage, the media should therefore produce more news on human rights with a thematic perspective to achieve more widespread implications.

On the other hand, the press is also facing existential challenges. The advent of digital technology has enabled individuals to take over the role of the media. In its simplest form, news production is no longer the exclusive domain of the media as it can also be carried out by individuals (Hayes, Singer, and Ceppos 2007). A personal approach is often preferred by readers because of its emphasis on experience and intimacy. Mancini (2020, 2022, 2023) refers to this as deinstitutionalization and reinstitutionalization, which are consequences of the digital revolution.

In general, deinstitutionalization is defined as “the transfer of social functions from established institutions (the news

organizations, the political parties, and the State itself)” to individual citizens (Mancini 2022, 6; 2023, 13). In the media, deinstitutionalization specifically refers to the decline of formal organizations that produce and distribute news being replaced by the role of individuals. This shift is exemplified by the emergence of social media, allowing individuals to become sources and producers of news (Ambardi et al. 2014; Mancini 2020). In a number of cases, information from social media is subsequently reproduced by traditional media outlets, exploiting aspects of virality and algorithmic logic (Mansell 2009). As a result, news production no longer follows media standards of public interest but focuses on profitability instead—a critical matter in the reporting of issues on human rights.

In a state of deinstitutionalization, the media operates outside of organized, hierarchical institutions, thus avoiding all forms of legal constraints or control. State borders are easily crossed. According to Mancini (2020, 2022), the rise of fake news is one of the emerging issues that resulted from this shift. The deinstitutionalization process is interconnected with reinstitutionalization. Mancini (2020, 5769) contends that reinstitutionalization is indicated by the replacement of old institutions with new ones bearing different characteristics. The concepts of deinstitutionalization and reinstitutionalization are tools of analysis employed in this study.

Another key aspect to highlight is that the digital era has also ushered in changes to the editorial work model. Relations between reporters and editors are no longer conducted in formal, in-depth settings to discuss editorial policies but are mediated via instant messaging technology instead (Ambardi et al. 2014, 42). According to researchers, such a work model allows for speed yet demonstrates superficiality as well because the media is driven by the rapid circulation of information, and the ability to keep up is a key parameter for assessing the media’s relevance to conditions on the ground.

Sen (2015) correlates the concept of communication rights with the media’s performance in reporting issues of human rights. Communication rights have evolved over time, particularly

influenced by new challenges in the fields of communication and information. In general, communication rights refer to the rights of individuals and groups to access, express, and participate in communication processes freely without restraints. This concept correlates with how the media and communication technology should be used as a tool to advocate for freedom of expression and fair, inclusive access to information. Communication rights do not only include the right to speak or express one's opinions but also the right to receive accurate and diverse information as well as the right to be involved in public discourse. The discourse on communication rights is both challenging and necessary in an open and transparent democratic culture due to the following reasons: (1) "access to infrastructure, capabilities, skills, services, qualitative content"; (2) "real diversity and pluralism of channels of expression and media outlets"; (3) "vibrant and pluralistic public spheres that go beyond the mainstream and respect difference and minority views"; (4) "independence, ethical norms and protection of journalists"; (5) "the common good, knowledge sharing and decommodification of information"; (6) "fair trade and sustainable development"; (7) "support for participatory citizens media initiatives" (Cammaerts and Carpentier 2007, 5).

Local online media research on issues of human rights in Indonesia remains nominal, particularly when linked with editorial policies developed by media outlets influenced by the digital revolution. The most frequently cited studies include local media research on local politics and democracy (Yanto et al. 2020; Yusuf 2011), local media and culture (Andrayani 2015; Rachelita and Ispandriarno 2014), and the management and configuration of local media capital including ownership (Ri'aeni and Sulistiana 2018). Local media research on human rights issues predominantly employed a textual analysis approach (Syobah and Sabiruddin 2022). Meanwhile, several local media studies in the context of online journalism are associated with the public sphere (Bangun 2016), industrial landscape (Hastjarjo 2017; Hendrawan 2013), investigative reporting through collaborative reporting (Lestari, Abrar, and Haque 2024), and concerns relating to accuracy and ethics (Emeraldien, Sugihartati, and Rahayu 2021).

In a more general aspect, there is still little research in human rights and media that highlights the problems between news formats, particularly the online media industry that makes media institutions increasingly vulnerable by combining two data simultaneously, namely newsroom data and text. Previous research has explored more of the role of media in human rights issues (Baradaran and Mostafeye 2017; Awuku 2019; Nwankwo 2011; Abdullah and Hussain 2015) or is only focused on specific coverage without linking it to the situation of the media industry (Ramos, Ron, and Thoms 2007; Cole 2010; Peksen, Peterson, and Drury 2014). The deinstitutionalization concept in this research makes researchers freer to see the relationship between the newsroom process, texts, and current online media business trends. Particularly, this study is interested in how issues of human rights are discussed in online media editorial rooms, investigating how these issues are discussed in editorial rooms and how the editorial policies influence news production.

3. METHOD

The current qualitative research focuses on two local online media outlets based in Yogyakarta: *Tribunjogja.com* and *Mojok.co*. We noticed that these two media outlets represent differing business models, news formats, and media company ages. *Tribunjogja.com* is part of *Tribunnews.com*, which is managed by PT. *Tribun Digital Online*. The platform boasts of 1,500 journalists participating in the *Tribun Network* across Indonesia since 2011 (*Tribunnews* 2025). Meanwhile, *Mojok.co* started as a community that was established in 2014 and became a media outlet in 2017, subsequently developing under *GDP Venture* (*GDP Venture*, n.d.). The news formats of both media outlets also differ. *Tribunjogja.com* offers more hard news, while *Mojok.co* is more casual and employs more user-generated content. Both media outlets have physical offices located in Yogyakarta, which, we believe, fosters close geographical and psychological ties to the dynamics of the local community. Given these considerations, *Tribunjogja.com* and *Mojok.co* were selected for this study because they are considered capable of

demonstrating the dynamics of online media in producing news on human rights, particularly regarding violations of privacy and freedom of expression.

Generally speaking, three methods were employed to obtain research data: qualitative content analysis (QCA) of online news articles, in-depth interviews with the editors-in-chief of both media outlets, and observations of their respective websites. The QCA we conducted involves searching for online news on *Tribunjogja.com* and *Mojok.co* that reported on issues regarding violations of privacy and freedom of expression as outlined in the second research question. This news search was carried out by using particular keywords: “data security”, “freedom of expression”, “freedom of speech”, “data privacy”, and “data leak”. Based on the researchers’ observations, these keywords are considered to represent issues on violations of privacy and freedom of expression throughout 2019–2024. This period was selected because during this particular time span in Indonesia many data leaks had occurred (Mediana 2024), and there was a decline in the democracy index (Mujani and Liddle 2021). The qualitative analysis was only conducted on search results for news produced by the media outlets through the reporting process, which was conducted by each of the media outlet’s journalists. Opinion pieces or articles written by readers that turned up in the search results were excluded accordingly. By applying such a method, 20 news articles were obtained.

Next, the news articles were qualitatively analyzed to identify any recurring patterns (see table 1 and table 2). Although the research questions do not specifically focus on the textual content of the news articles, understanding how the media outlets cover human rights issues, particularly those relating to violations of privacy and freedom of expression, remains of great significance. By using QCA, we identified specific trends based on the collected data, which would inform subsequent observations and in-depth interviews we conducted with the editorial staff (Schreier 2012).

Table 1. Summary of Qualitative Analysis: Mojok.co News Reports

News Report	Theme	Approach
“Personal Data Leak Recurs, Expert Says Fix Necessary”	Data Leak	Episodic, Lacking Depth
“21,000 Companies in Indonesia Suspected of Data Leak, Sold for 50,000 US Dollars”	Data Privacy	Episodic, Lacking Depth
“105 Million Voter Data Leaked, KPU Confident Data is Secured”	Data Leak	Episodic, Lacking Depth
“Borrowing Money from Lecturers, Students Entangled with Online Loan Aggravating Campus Unrest”	Data Security	Personalization
“You Need to Know! What Forms of Violence Against Women Exist in the Political Space”	Freedom of Speech	Commentary
“Ahead of the Political Year, Mahfud MD Encourages Youths to Actively Criticize the Government, Unfortunately, Freedom of Expression Remains Low”	Freedom of Expression	Commentary
“Check for SIM Card Data Leaks, this Website Can Be Used”	Data Leak	Episodic, Commentary
“More than 17 Million PLN Data Suspected to have been Leaked, Ministry of Communication and Information Technology still Investigating”	Data Leak	Episodic, Commentary, Lacking Depth
“Bjorka’s Track Record: Leaking Government Data and Preparing to Hack Pertamina”	Data Leak	Episodic, Commentary, Lacking Depth
“Freedom of Speech Taken Away Because of Being Too Feminist”	Freedom of Speech	Personalization

Table 2. Summary of Qualitative Analysis: Tribunjogja.com News Reports

News Report	Theme	Approach
“UII-Komnas HAM RI Hold Panel Discussion: Freedom of Speech Easy to Say, Difficult to Do”	Freedom of Speech	Commentary, Lacking Depth
“Dialogue is Key to Resolving International Conflict”	Freedom of Expression	Commentary, Lacking Depth
“JPW Condemns Disbandment of Discussion between Din Syamsuddin and Refly Harun in Mampang Jakarta”	Freedom of Speech	Commentary, Lacking Depth
“Advocacy Team Made a #FreeRobet Petition, Hundreds have Signed”	Freedom of Expression	Episodic, Commentary
“IKD Achievement in the City of Jogja Remains at 1.68 Percent, Yogyakarta City Government Guarantees Data Security”	Data Security	Commentary, Lacking Depth
“Data Protection must be Implemented, Minister of Communication and Information Technology must take Responsibility for Alleged PDN Hacking”	Data Security	Commentary, Lacking Depth
“After the PDN Hack, Personal Data Allegedly Belonging to the Ministry of Communication and Information Technology is being Sold on X”	Data Leak	Episodic, Commentary
“Anies Baswedan Says Freedom of Expression in Indonesia Remains Low”	Freedom of Expression	Episodic, Commentary, Lacking Depth
“Anticipating Public Service Data Leaks: Steps Taken by the Yogyakarta City Government”	Data Leak	Episodic, Commentary, Lacking Depth
“UGM Sociologist Reveals Challenges Facing Indonesian Democracy, Building a Public Space Free from Hate Speech”	Freedom of Speech	Commentary, Lacking Depth

To supplement the results from the QCA, we interviewed the editors-in-chief of both media outlets. The editor-in-chief is the person who best understands the newsroom process in producing news. They are also in charge of translating the media outlet's vision into the technical aspects, such as news coverage and editing. The presence of two key informants, the editor-in-chief of Mojok.co (Informant 1) and the editor-in-chief of Tribunjogja.com (Informant 2), is crucial because we were able to obtain substantial information that was not revealed in the QCA. Interviews are helpful in qualitative research, especially in cases where participants cannot be directly observed (Creswell 2009). Accordingly, the questions raised in the interviews were aimed at gathering insights and opinions from individuals who have direct knowledge of the editorial situation and are part of the editorial decision-making process.

The final step involved observations of the entire news website of each media outlet, which included their layout, section structure, feature functionality, and other elements that emerged as significant trends. By conducting observations, we gained direct experience and uncovered significant or "unusual" findings that eventually became key findings in the study (Creswell 2009).

4. RESULTS

4A. QCA OF NEWS PRODUCED BY MOJOK.CO AND TRIBUNJOGJA.COM

The results of the study indicate that both media outlets covered and wrote about human rights violation events, particularly on issues pertaining to the violation of privacy and freedom of expression by using the commentary news approach and personalization. However, the news produced by these outlets oftentimes are not investigative news. Therefore, these are lacking depth or are superficial in nature due to different factors.

In this study, we refer to commentary news as news containing comments stated by sources without any significant effort to dive deeper into the discussion using data or observations made by the journalists. The concept of commentaries in journalism actually

refers to opinions written by columnists or editorials indicating the author's name (Morlandstø and Mathisen 2022). However, Fernández Parratt (1998 cited in Marín Arrese and Núñez Perucha 2006, 226) stated that oftentimes news reporting also makes use of sources that covertly exploit their subjective position to comment on certain realities. According to the study of Esser and Umbricht (2014), commentary news in some countries is opinion-based news implemented in a hard news style.

This trend is apparently observed in the hard news produced by Mojok.co. Examples include the following news reports: “105 Million Voter Data Leaked, KPU Confident Data is Secured”¹; “Personal Data Leak Recurs, Expert Says Fix Necessary”²; “21,000 Companies in Indonesia Suspected of Data Leak, Sold for 50,000 US Dollars.”³ These news articles are placed in the “Kilas” section with a hard news style emphasizing crucial and up-to-date information that the public need to immediately receive. The content of the section refers to ongoing events. For instance, the news article “105 Million Voter Data Leaked, KPU Confident Data is Secured” was published on September 8, 2022. This article discusses a data leak on the website of Komisi Pemilihan Umum (KPU), the Indonesian Election Commission. The perpetrator of the data leak, claimed to be identified as Bjorka, is said to have access to 105,003,428 data of Indonesian citizens from the 2019 General Election Final Voter List. In the article, members of KPU and the Indonesian Communication and Information System Security Research Center (CISSReC) were the sources contacted to elaborate on the problem, its short-term impacts, and regulatory issues. No effort was made to emphasize the impact of this event on the public and the long-term consequences that may unfold. All data were sourced from Antara, an Indonesian news agency, which Mojok.co subscribes to.

Informant 1 described this hard news format, which prioritizes topicality, as news that cannot compete with similar news published by online media outlets that employ more journalists and have higher productivity. The data shown in the news article was processed from other media outlets (which in this case was Antara). Changing the hard news format into in-depth reporting

by presenting comprehensive data is not an option for Mojok.co because such efforts would require an exceedingly large number of resources. The informant admitted that given its limited number of journalists, Mojok.co is unable to produce in-depth news articles. We believe that it is at this point that the commentary news format becomes the journalistic product that is more likely to be produced by Mojok.co.

The lack of resources compelled Mojok.co to abandon its hard news format. They shifted to feature news articles that present stories of individuals who are dealing with problems that correlate with issues pertaining to violations of privacy and freedom of expression. At this point, a change from the hard news approach to the non-hard news approach emphasizing personalization was noticed. Personalization refers to a method of reporting and news writing that emphasizes “individual experiences, feelings, and perspectives” (Zhou and Niederdeppe 2017 cited in Wald et al. 2021, 2). For example, the news article titled “Borrowing Money from Lecturers, Students Entangled with Online Loan Aggravating Campus Unrest”⁴ presents the story of a student, entangled in an online loan and all the problems it caused, confessing to his supervisor and asking for a solution. This occurred at Universitas Indonesia, Depok, West Java. Additionally, the journalist also leveraged a relevant incident that unfolded at Institut Pertanian Bogor (IPB Bogor). To make it even more personal and intimate, the journalist interviewed three lecturers from universities in Yogyakarta to present the perspectives of their campus. The first lecturer talked about his student who is facing problems with the online loan. In contrast, the second and third lecturers presented the perspective of campus policies for resolving problems faced by students entrapped in online loans. Other sources included two lecturers from Surabaya State University and Surabaya Muhammadiyah University who provided their perspectives on financial literacy.

While indirectly correlated with data privacy and data breaches, this news article is believed to be more likely produced by Mojok.co. The personal touch presented in the story of a student who was engaged in an online loan is considered more feasible.

Additionally, it still represents a national issue pertaining to data vulnerability, which is intertwined with the issue of financial literacy. Informant 1 said that this kind of news article is more relevant to Mojok.co's audience.

Another news article titled "You Need to Know! What Forms of Violence Against Women Exist in the Political Space"⁵ does not directly discuss the issue of freedom of expression, but it focuses more on the issue of violence against women. The journalist wrote this article based on the Parliament Action incident, a sixteen-day campaign combatting violence against women. In the article, data from the 2016 World Parliamentary Forum survey regarding the percentage of parliamentary members who experienced violence was presented by a source who was a member of Dewan Perwakilan Rakyat (DPR), the Indonesian House of Representatives. Additionally, other data from a 2018 study conducted by Komnas Perempuan (the National Commission on Violence Against Women) was quoted via Magdalene, an online news website with a specific interest in women's issues. Komnas Perempuan is an institution founded by the Indonesian government in 1998 (post-New Order) to conduct research, monitor fact disclosures, and document all forms of violence against women (Komnas Perempuan 2020).

As a whole, this news article demonstrates the journalist's limited perspective and coverage, resulting in key issues being presented merely based on data from other sources without any attempt to make the article more in-depth and relevant to the public. The option of writing a more thematic story was not an attractive one. As our informant stated, stories with a hard news format featuring commentaries of various sources did not generate high traffic. Ultimately, this format was discontinued.

Another news story on freedom of expression was found in an article titled "Ahead of the Political Year, Mahfud MD Encourages Youths to Actively Criticize the Government, Unfortunately, Freedom of Expression Remains Low."⁶ The source of this news story was Mahfud MD, the Coordinating Minister for Politics, Law, and Human Rights at the time. The comment featured in the body of the article was sourced from

his speech in an event with the theme “Tut Wuri Handayani: Encouraging and Finding Political Role Models for Young People.” Another source was Andi Widjajanto, the Governor of Lembaga Ketahanan Nasional – Lemhanas (National Resilience Institute), who also attended the event.

Research by Morlandstø and Mathisen (2017) states that commentary journalism represents subjectivity and is considered to be aimed at reaching and enlivening public debates as well as providing space for the public to participate and contribute. However, McNair (2017) criticized situations in which the media is highly dependent on sources, particularly those from the elites. Instead, the public should be given an egalitarian space because they are knowledgeable and are close to reality. Dependence on elite sources is also observed in news articles produced by Mojok.co and Tribunjogja.com, which results in a very pronounced government nuance being discerned throughout the stories.

Generally speaking, articles about freedom of expression on Tribunjogja.com also have strong commentary news nuance. As an example, a news article titled “The Freedom of Expression Advocacy Team Made a #FreeRobet Petition, Hundreds have Signed”⁷ reports the arrest and naming of democracy activist Robertus Robet as a suspect while making a speech during Aksi Kamisan (Black Thursday Silent Action). The article featured statements from the Freedom of Expression Advocacy Team, which consists of various pro-democracy and human rights organizations. The information cited by the journalist came from the publication team of the change.org/FreeRobet petition.

The commentary news approach was also used to write news articles such as “UII-Komnas HAM RI Hold Panel Discussion: Freedom of Speech Easy to Say, Difficult to Do”⁸; “Dialogue is Key to Resolving International Conflict”⁹; “JPW Condemns Disbandment of Discussion between Din Syamsuddin and Refly Harun in Mampang Jakarta”¹⁰; and other news stories. The writing of these news articles does not provide a broad perspective because they employ source commentaries as the primary material. As a result, these news articles tend to focus on a single perspective.

Tribunjogja.com also produced news articles on data privacy by using a similar method. For instance, in the article titled “IKD Achievement in the City of Jogja Remains at 1.68 Percent, Yogyakarta City Government Guarantees Data Security,”¹¹ the sole source came from the government, thus preventing the debate surrounding the population data leak from being entirely explored. Furthermore, the public interest is not reflected in the article. Another tendency of this method is that news on this topic is often associated with the technological approach. In this case, the news only discusses the issue from the perspective of the application’s security risk and does not discuss the social consequences that would occur if the IKD (Identitas Kependudukan Digital or digital identity) targets were not met. This has an impact on simplifying complex issues and neglecting aspects of humanity, including human rights.

Table 3. Dynamics of News Production on Human Rights Issues

	Mojok.co	Tribunjogja.com
Episodic Frame and Commentary News Approach	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hard news format • Less likely to show the impact of a case • Does not show long-term consequences • Uses a commentary news approach • Furthermore, the hard news format changed to a feature with a personalized approach due to the limited number of journalists. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hard news format • Data privacy issues are viewed from a technological perspective • Issues are simplified, thus eliminating the human rights aspect • News contains commentary by figures or academics • Lacks depth, thus maintaining a single perspective
Personalization	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Focus on individual stories • Considered to bring in more traffic than in-depth news (thematic stories) 	<p><i>*Tribunjogja.com uses hard news formats more often than soft news or features, so the aspect of personalization does not appear.</i></p>

Therefore, we are of the opinion that personalization and commentary news downplay human rights issues because they focus on individual stories and fail to reflect wider discourses. Mojok.co opted for commentary news before eventually shifting

to narratives that highlight more personal stories. Meanwhile, Tribunjogja.com consistently uses the hard news format, making commentary news the aspect that we most frequently observed. Despite both media outlets having different dynamics in news coverage and writing, they generally failed to present human rights issues, particularly on violations of privacy and freedom of expression, in an in-depth manner. The general findings regarding news production from the QCA method can be seen in table 3.

4B. ONLINE MEDIA EDITORIAL POLICIES FOR RESPONDING TO HUMAN RIGHTS SITUATIONS

The editorial policies described in this section result from interviews with editors-in-chief and the researcher's observations at both media outlets. In general, human rights issues, particularly those relating to violations of privacy and freedom of expression, have not fully received due attention from media editorial departments. This is due to editorial policies that focus more on commercial needs and media strategies for survival. Results of the interviews indicate that survival strategies in the media industry are influenced by both technical and non-technical factors.

Technical factors include the limited number of journalists and the absence of a special desk or editorial team that is specifically dedicated to covering issues of human rights. Both factors have a grave impact on editorial policies. For instance, a shortage of reporters compels editorial teams to recruit and train journalists who would technically be required to multitask.

Informant 2 stated that Tribunjogja.com requires multitalented journalists who are proficient at producing texts, photos, and videos. These aptitudes are considered vital in addition to being motivated and having competent skills to write in-depth news about significant events or certain topics. When linked to the digital media environment, this situation sets journalists to become workers who must transform into content creators and digital workers. This subsequently places them in a precarious position otherwise known as "precariat labor" (Dolber et al. 2021).

Another technical issue affecting media policies is competition among online media outlets, particularly in terms of speed and depth of news coverage. Informant 2 stated that the digital era demands rapid news production while still maintaining accuracy. Furthermore, the rise of “homeless media” and social media, including influencers, has resulted in online mass media losing some of their public influence. Homeless media relies on social media platforms as its primary medium for disseminating information. It usually does not have a website and is not officially registered as media. In general, they do not formally practice journalism (Riyanto 2024).

Informant 2 noted that there is a perception among the public that journalists are merely “confirmation agents” of viral episodes on social media. The editorial team at *Tribunjogja.com* admitted that information coming from homeless media still needs coverage since they are still a part of various information sources. Nonetheless, Informant 2 assessed that media outlets remain superior because journalists conduct direct field coverage, thereby generating verified content.

In relation to the dynamics of the digital environment, the post-Fordism era created a dynamic in which content can instantaneously go viral and anyone has the potential to become a producer and disseminator of information. Speed and flexibility in content production is leading toward the rapid adoption of the latest trend, often at the expense of depth or accuracy. In this context, both individuals and organizations scramble to follow viral trends in order to attract maximum attention and interaction (Ozgun 2011). We observed that *Tribunjogja.com* benefits from the virality of content present on social media. By making social media as one of their latest sources of information, they indirectly strive to be relevant and have high visibility in order to boost the number of their readers. Otherwise, the presence of *Mojok.co* and *Tribunjogja.com* would be less than homeless media.

Bearing in mind their limited number of journalists, *Mojok.co* strives to avoid competing in speed. Informant 1 explained that since early 2021, their team had developed a distinct reporting style that does not prioritize speed. They focus

on writing non-hard news pieces with a unique perspective on events that are seemingly insignificant. This approach was specifically adopted when the majority of content were coming from user-generated content rather than professional journalists.

Given the limited number of journalists they employ, Mojok.co applies a peer-to-peer news gatekeeping system. This means that news editing not only relies on the editor-in-chief or editors, but it can also be done by fellow journalists. This system, in addition to addressing the lack of resources, is also safer because no news would be published without going through an editing process. The peer-to-peer mechanism is not a formal system adopted by the media outlet. Informant 1 shared that it was just a term they would use to describe the unique gatekeeping practices the editors apply.

The peer-to-peer system, however, is not devoid of problems. To inexperienced journalists, such conditions are prone to ethical violations, especially for news stories related to conflict. Informant 1 is well-aware that this is not an ideal mechanism. The lack of reporters as well as the demand for speed and high traffic count leave media outlets highly susceptible to committing ethical violations. This has often caused the rise in protests by sources or other parties quoted in their news articles. Accordingly, Mojok.co shifted from a hard news format to a feature news format. This approach is considered much safer and less controversial. Furthermore, it makes the competition they are facing focused on the uniqueness of the news perspective instead of speed in generating content.

In addition to the technical factors mentioned above, the current study also identified the dynamics of non-technical factors that influence editorial policies. One of these factors is the primary goal of the editorial policies to ensure business viability and sustainability. This is further complicated by the fact that journalists are, both directly and indirectly, burdened by marketing tasks, such as producing click-generating news articles. This implies that digital space complicates the situation journalists are in, turning them into frontline workers in the attention economy that is closely linked to the digital world (Brynjolfsson and Oh 2012).

The informant from Mojok.co also acknowledged this. Given limited resources, focusing on features serves as a way to counter limited coverage while still attracting high traffic. But as an editor-in-chief, he is aware that quality writing does not necessarily correlate with readership. For example, articles unrelated to the public interest can still attract a large number of readers. This situation leads to serious internal discussions within the editorial team.

The lack of clear boundaries between editorial and non-editorial duties, including marketing, is a dangerous situation for journalists. This leads to editorial intervention for business purposes rather than improving news coverage or quality. Concerns regarding the presence of influencers, as expressed by Informant 2, reflect concerns about business sustainability rather than news quality. The informant expressed concern about the government often disseminating information via influencers, rather than through traditional media. This not only disrupts business sustainability, but it also affects public trust in the media.

Mojok.co, as a relatively new media outlet, is also facing pressure from the management to boost its profit. Journalists are required to produce news articles that generate high traffic. However, as a young media business entity, such a demand goes against the vision of Mojok.co that allows journalists to work with a reasonable workload. This means that balancing working hours, workload, and high traffic requirement is a difficult feat. It also reflects the complexity of new online media outlets that are not only struggling with improving news quality and quantity but are also still striving to find the best model for them.

Due to these factors, the study finds that *Tribunjogja.com* and *Mojok.co* now operate under the shadow of algorithmic power and the rise of social media, including the presence of influencers who attract more public attention than traditional media. While not explicitly acknowledged, this phenomenon is most apparent.

Mojok.co has even had an editor-in-chief named Agus Mulyadi who was also a content creator and influencer popularly known among young people. The concept of “newsfluencer”

represents how the world of journalism is being disrupted by creators that operate based on the cultural and economic rationale of online influencers to generate news content for a participatory audience (Hurcombe 2024; Kern 2024).

The low level of media response to issues of human rights, particularly those relating to violations of privacy and freedom of expression, is also reflected in the way the media categorizes and frames their coverage. Interviews with and observations of the editorial staff and structure of *Tribunjogja.com* indicate that their editorial desk comprises a city desk, a sports desk, and a regional desk. Journalists on the city desk cover events held by the Yogyakarta Provincial Government, Yogyakarta Municipal Government, the Forum Koordinasi Pimpinan Daerah – Forkopimda (Regional Leadership Coordination Forum); news on business and economy, criminal law, higher education institution; and tasks allocated to the floating desk. They use the term “floating desk” to refer to other desks outside the predetermined ones. Journalists assigned to a floating desk are responsible for covering all events and activities that are not covered by the permanent desks. This usually occurs due to limited journalist resources, thus requiring them to be flexible in covering various issues or events.

In journalism, such flexibility means that journalists are required to be able to work quickly, adapt to continuously evolving digital platforms, and keep up with trending news dynamics without necessarily sacrificing quality. However, regardless of their freedom to explore and innovate, such flexibility also requires journalists to consider new challenges such as the commodification of news and the pressure to produce viral content at high speeds (Lovering 2009).

Based on the desk structure of the media outlets, news pertaining to human rights is most likely produced by using a non-human rights approach, such as a legal viewpoint, or may be covered by journalists from the city desk. Results of the interview revealed that there are no journalists specifically assigned to focus on human rights issues despite their regular participation in trainings about human rights. This is why coverage regarding

violations of freedom of expression and privacy is approached from various perspectives that are not synonymous with human rights. This indicates that the media has not fully shown a strong concern for human rights. Moreover, the media is actually aware that violations of privacy and freedom of expression are crucial challenges that *Tribunjogja.com* and *Mojok.co* are addressing in their attempt to improve the freedom of the press index.

4C. NEWS PRODUCTION ABOUT HUMAN RIGHTS

The interviews, observations, and QCA results show that the two media outlets tend to report on issues of human rights episodically rather than thematically. This is apparent in their coverage style that focuses on source commentary, personal narratives, local (even hyperlocal) issues, and their tendency of following viral trends on social media.

For all types of news coverage, *Tribunjogja.com* relies on field reporters to amplify hyperlocal issues and offers local perspectives on national and global issues. They believe that very local issues, such as human interest stories of people in Yogyakarta, cannot be covered by national media. If these hyperlocal issues are relevant to the Yogyakarta audience, a strong response can be gained. Furthermore, they frequently interview academics as part of their efforts to provide readers with intellectual value. Informant 2 stated that analyses from academics are quite important to present in news coverage.

However, we are of the view that the concept of locality and hyper-locality can be defined not only as a method of news production but also as a survival strategy in the local online media business. By highlighting local issues, they want to remain relevant to readers so that this media outlet will always be needed. Additionally, allocating significant space for academic comments may confine the media to applying the commentary news format. Relying on these secondary sources' interpretations of events risks losing context, often resulting in mere commentaries on incidents instead.

5. DISCUSSION

The trend toward personalization and localization (even hyper-localization) can be defined as an effort to facilitate journalists in covering news amidst the demands of algorithms, of speed, and of the hustle and bustle of the communication and information space. As a result, the media becomes entrapped in episodic rather than thematic coverage.

From a normative perspective, such episodic framing is perhaps advantageous because it allows ordinary citizens to be highlighted, thus generally satisfying commercial demands due to its greater appeal. Episodic coverage becomes even more nascent in the context of the drive for cheaper content creation. In the context of participatory democracy, this may stimulate a more diverse marketplace of ideas as well as allow citizens to represent their interests by disrupting the hegemonic narratives of elite sources (Boukes 2021).

In the case of *Tribunjogja.com*, incorporating academic commentary to respond to specific issues can be seen as an attempt to bring public opinion into media space. But, on the other hand, this opens up the possibility of falling into the same patterns observed on social media, including the involvement of influencers or the creation of space for popular individuals to comment on on-going situations. As a result, episodic framing becomes exponentially powerful.

In the context of competitive democracy, episodic framing can undermine the citizen's ability to understand the connections between abstract political issues. It can increase focus on personalization (focusing on personal rather than social issues) and dramatization because the goal is not only to inform but also to encourage consumption by a wider audience (Boukes 2021).

A similar situation unfolded when *Mojok.co* had to concede to these demands given its limited number of journalists and inability to match the speed promised by the online media industry. Personal narratives became a compromise in this situation. However, this approach risked narrowing the scope of the issue, turning public issues into personal ones, instead

of revealing the “tip of the iceberg” of human rights violations. Furthermore, it disadvantaged coverage of human rights issues, which inherently involves the state, regulation, and unresolved history of human rights violations in the country. Attention to violations of freedom of expression and privacy is complex and cannot be established through a personal approach.

Table 4. Characteristics and Impact of Episodic Coverage on Human Rights Issues

Characteristics	Impact
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Hard news that lacks depth • Issues are viewed from a single perspective (e.g., data privacy is viewed only from a technological perspective) • News is based on event coverage rather than in-depth issue analysis (e.g., demonstrations, legal violations, etc.) • Relies heavily on the commentary of sources (only on comments from individuals who experienced the situation or experts and government elites) • News fails to demonstrate patterns, trends, and long-term consequences (a very local approach that is not based on the impact on individuals). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reducing issues as part of a system to random issues • Simplifying human rights violations as ordinary violations • Critical and in-depth discussions and the complexity of the problem are not visible

The approach Mojok.co took failed in presenting patterns, trends, or broader contexts. All were presented on a case-by-case basis. The media’s reliance on events also restricted the exposure of human rights issues because these are not daily occurrences. Revealing specific issues and discourses (beyond events) is crucial to prevent the media from relying solely on incidents and source commentaries. As such, media flexibility can enable more comprehensive discussions on issues of human rights. Table 4 summarizes the characteristics of episodic coverage carried out by Mojok.co and Tribunajogja.com along with the consequences.

The media situation we previously discussed becomes even more interesting when observed through the lens of deinstitutionalization. Deinstitutionalization, which is rooted

in individuals, is also a practice adopted by Mojok.co and Tribunjogja.com due to the shift in journalistic work standards and trends that focus on locality and personalization.

One of the attributes of deinstitutionalization is the disappearance of formal organizations that produce and disseminate news. “Disappearance” here does not mean extinction, instead it refers to organizations evolving into more informally run ones. Furthermore, the absence of geographical boundaries weakens the formality of media activities (Mancini 2020).

The peer-to-peer news gatekeeping system applied by Mojok.co exemplifies the lack of formality in news production. In a more conventional system, gatekeeping is centered around the editor-in-chief or several select editors, but this no longer applies. A formal gatekeeping mechanism is not only costly because it requires sufficient resources, but the business demands of the media and speed required for digital news production have made it impossible for Mojok.co to adopt such a system.

Meanwhile, Tribunjogja.com, which is also facing a shortage of journalists (though not as severe as Mojok.co), recognizes its limitations in covering what is happening in society. Homeless media is recognized for its speed because it relies on netizens to create content. The platform functions as an initial source of information to be further elaborated into news stories. On the one hand, this effort is considered a way to bring real world events into the media space. But on the other hand, it can be seen as an effort to simplify the news reporting process for faster coverage.

The concepts and reality presented by Mancini (2020) highlight how the digital revolution has transformed news producers into less stable and unorganized entities that operate without established hierarchies, rules, or processes. While the informal nature of news producers often centers on social media, blogs, and citizen journalism, this trend is also evident in more formal mass media outlets. As evidenced by the strategy of Mojok.co, the media outlet strives to report about common people and personal narratives, which are often the main material found in social media content. Citizens are therefore given space and do

appear to have a place in the media. However, when we correlate this with episodic reporting, it risks obscuring larger issues.

The concept of deinstitutionalization also touches on the media's ability to mobilize the masses in the digital era. The tendency to always be synchronized with social media, whether through media convergence or by considering viral trends and algorithms, can be understood as a form of citizen mobilization. However, we believe that quantitative mass mobilization can obscure the essence of human rights news stories, which requires depth and sustained discourse within society. Under more extreme circumstances, communication can be a powerful instrument of control and censorship. In particular, under totalitarian regimes, "digital communication increases the possibility for controlling citizens and limiting their freedom of expression and more" (Mancini 2020, 5765).

The findings in this study indicate the existence of industrial and media realities that hinder the right to communicate (for both individuals and the media) and the development of more comprehensive issues of human rights. These have an impact on how journalists position the reality of human rights violations. Given their multitasking principle and limited human resources, journalists obscure the essence of human rights news. Yet, such news requires special attention and empathy. If we refer to the right to communicate, the media must be able to reflect the diversity of a pluralistic society by including marginal and minority groups. Based on their approaches to responding to and producing news on human rights, both Mojok.co and Tribunjogja.com are unable to fulfill the public's right to communicate.

If Mojok.co and Tribunjogja.com were to continue reporting about violations of human rights as episodic phenomena without connecting them to broader systemic and structural contexts, they would exacerbate the public's understanding about the root causes of the problem. Human rights violations are not merely incidental events that occur in isolation; they are part of a larger policy or pattern involving abuse of power, impunity, and failure of the legal system. By treating them as isolated issues, Mojok.co and Tribunjogja.com undermine the urgency for

structural change in upholding human rights. As a result, society loses collective awareness required for systemic reform. This situation hampers preventive measures because the public will only view these violations as mere incidents rather than as symptoms of deeper issues in state governance.

6. CONCLUSION

In conclusion, it has become increasingly difficult for public interests to be served by the media, particularly regarding issues of human rights. Mojok.co and Tribunjogja.com respond to the human rights situations by disseminating news articles that tend to be episodic, personal, and commentary-based. Incidents relating to violations of privacy and freedom of expression are no longer seen as a pattern or as part of a broader chain of events. Such an approach has resulted in news contexts becoming more focused on events and losing depth. At the same time, shifts in news production models and methods have become essential and inseparable dynamics, such as demands for high traffic, speed, and deinstitutionalization, driving journalism into becoming more personal. Unless they are cautious, Mojok.co and Tribunjogja.com will position journalists at the same level as content creators. Not to mention that there is also the demand to multitask. Under such circumstances, journalists as workers are situated in an extremely precarious position.

As news producing institutions, Mojok.co and Tribunjogja.com find themselves in a problematic situation. They are unable to present news with in-depth perspectives on human rights. On the one hand, they are under intense pressure that leaves them incapable of maintaining independence given that their business model has been disrupted by the digital landscape. On the other hand, the editorial practices conducted by Mojok.co and Tribunjogja.com, by and large, have the potential of alienating the public from their ability to view human rights issues in a holistic manner and diminishing the presence of space for conveying criticism.

This study, therefore, contributes to the development of academic discourse on the vulnerability of the media industry,

particularly online media, to various problems that cause media texts to become increasingly shallow, such as personalized, episodic approaches and concise editorial processes. This condition poses a serious challenge to developing increasingly complex human rights issues. Furthermore, the difficulty of surviving in a dynamic digital environment forces the media to seek various ways to survive and attract more readers for media profits. Moreover, this research demonstrates that future media research needs to continually examine how the newsroom becomes a space of contestation between idealism and commercialism.

TABLES

- 1 Summary of Qualitative Analysis: Mojok.co News Reports
- 2 Summary of Qualitative Analysis: Tribunjogja.com News Reports
- 3 Dynamics of News Production on Human Rights Issues
- 4 Characteristics and Impact of Episodic Coverage on Human Rights Issues

NOTES

- 1 See Kenia Intan, 2022, "105 Juta Data Pemilih Bocor, KPU Meykini Miliknya Aman," *Mojok.co*, September 8, 2022, <https://mojok.co/kilas/105-juta-data-pemilih-bocor-kpu-meyakini-miliknya-aman/>.
- 2 See Kenia Intan, 2022, "Kebocoran Data Pribadi Terjadi lagi, Pakar Sebut Hal Ini Perlu Diperbaiki," *Mojok.co*, August 20, 2022, <https://mojok.co/kilas/kebocoran-data-pribadi-terjadi-lagi-pakar-sebut-hal-ini-perlu-diperbaiki/>.
- 3 See Agung Purwandono, 2022, "21.000 Perusahaan di Indonesia Diduga Mengalami Kebocoran Data, Dijual 50 Ribu Dollar AS," *Mojok.co*, August 19, 2022, <https://mojok.co/kilas/21-000-perusahaan-di-indonesia-diduga-mengalami-kebocoran-data-dijual-50-ribu-dollar-as/>.
- 4 See Hammam Izzudin, 2023, "Sampai Pinjam Uang Dosen, Mahasiswa Terjerat Pinjol Kian Mencemaskan Kampus," *Mojok.co*, August 11, 2023, <https://mojok.co/liputan/kampus/sampai-pinjam-uang-dosen-mahasiswa-terjerat-pinjol-kian-mencemaskan-kampus/>.
- 5 See Kenia Intan, 2022, "Perlu Tahu! Apa Saja Bentuk Kekerasan terhadap Perempuan di Ruang Politik?," *Mojok.co*, December 29, 2022, <https://mojok.co/kilas/perlu-tahu-apa-saja-bentuk-kekerasan-terhadap-perempuan-di-ruang-politik/>.

- 6 See Ahmed Effendi, 2023, “Jelang Tahun Politik, Mahfud MD Minta Pemuda aktif Pemerintah, Sayangnya Kebebasan Berpendapat Masih Rendah,” *Mojok.co*, March 9, 2023, <https://mojok.co/kotak-suara/jelang-tahun-politik-mahfud-md-minta-pemuda-aktif-kritik-pemerintah-sayangnya-kebebasan-berpendapat-masih-rendah/>.
- 7 See Hari Susmayanti, 2019, “Tim Advokasi Kebebasan Berekspresi Buat Petisi #BebaskanRobet, Ratusan Orang Sudah Tandatangani,” *TribunJogja*, March 7, 2019, <https://jogja.tribunnews.com/2019/03/07/tim-advokasi-kebebasan-berekspresi-buat-petisi-bebaskanrobet-ratusan-orang-sudah-tandatangani?page=3>.
- 8 See Ardhike Indah, 2024, “UUI-Komnas HAM RI Gelar Diskusi Panel: Kebebasan Berpendapat Mudah Dikatakan, Sulit Dilakukan,” *TribunJogja*, April 26, 2024, <https://jogja.tribunnews.com/2024/04/26/uui-komnas-ham-ri-gelar-diskusi-panel-kebebasan-berpendapat-mudah-dikatakan-sulit-dilakukan>.
- 9 See Alexander Aprita, 2020, “Dialog Jadi Kunci Penyelesaian Konflik Internasional,” *TribunJogja*, January 24, 2020, <https://jogja.tribunnews.com/2020/01/24/dialog-jadi-kunci-penyelesaian-konflik-internasional>.
- 10 See Miftahul Huda, 2024, “JPW Kecam Pembubaran Diskusi Din Syamsuddin dan Refly Harun di Mampang Jakarta,” *TribunJogja*, September 29, 2024, <https://jogja.tribunnews.com/2024/09/29/jpw-kecam-pembubaran-diskusi-din-syamsuddin-dan-refly-harun-di-mampang-jakarta>.
- 11 See Aska Ramadhan, 2023, “Capaian IKD di Kota Jogja Masih 1,68 Persen, Pemkot Yogyakarta Jamin Keamanan Data,” *TribunJogja*, September 20, 2023, <https://jogja.tribunnews.com/2023/09/20/capaian-ikd-di-kota-jogja-masih-168-persen-pemkot-yogyakarta-jamin-keamanan-data>.

REFERENCES

- Abdullah, and Akhtar Hussain. 2015. “Role of media in protection of human rights (An analytical study of few newspaper).” *Global Journal for Research Analysis* (GJRA) 4 (4): 1-2.
- Aditya, Nicholas Ryan, and Krisiandi. 2020. “Catatan SAFENet: 8 Kasus Jurnalis Terjerat UU ITE Sepanjang 2019.” *Kompas.Com* (Jakarta), November 14, 2020. <https://nasional.kompas.com/read/2020/11/14/05050021/catatan-safenet--8-kasus-jurnalis-terjerat-uu-ite-sepanjang-2019?page=all>.
- Ambardi, Kuskridho, Gilang Parahita, Lisa Lindawati, Adam Sukarno, and Nella Aprilia. 2014. *Mapping Digital Media: Indonesia - A Report by the Open Society Foundations*. Edited by Marius Dragomir, Mark Thompson, and Graham Watts. Open Society Foundations. <https://www.opensocietyfoundations.org/publications/mapping-digital-media-indonesia>.
- Andrayani, Kristina. 2015. “Budaya, identitas, dan media lokal.” *Profetik: Jurnal Komunikasi* 8 (2): 5-14.

- Awuku, Wisdom Peter. 2019. "Media as a defender of human rights issues in India: Myth or reality?" *International Journal of Social Science and Humanities Research* 7 (2): 106-14.
- Aziz, Firman, Nanny Mayasari, Sabhan Sabhan, Zulkifli Zulkifli, and Moh. Fatah Yasin. 2022. "The future of human rights in the Digital Age: Indonesian perspectives and challenges." *Journal of Digital Law and Policy* 2 (1): 29-40. <https://doi.org/10.58982/jdlp.v2i1.292>.
- Bales, Susan Nall. 2005. *Framing Public Issues*. Frame Work Institute.
- Bangun, Cendera Rizky Anugrah. 2016. "Citizen's voice on local cybermedia Balebengong." *Humaniora* 7 (4): 523. <https://doi.org/10.21512/humaniora.v7i4.3605>.
- Baradaran, Hasan, and Fardin Mostafeye. 2017. "Mass media and the promotion of human rights discourse." *Specialty Journal of Politics and Law* 2 (2): 78-86.
- Boukes, Mark. 2021. "Episodic and thematic framing effects on the attribution of responsibility: The effects of personalized and contextualized news on perceptions of individual and political responsibility for causing the economic crisis." *The International Journal of Press/Politics* 27 (2): 374-95. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1940161220985241>.
- Brooten, Lisa. 2017. "Media, human rights and political discourse." In *The Routledge Companion to Media and Human Rights*. 1st edition. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315619835-43>.
- Brynjolfsson, Erik, and JooHee Oh. 2012. "The attention economy: Measuring the value of free digital services on the internet." *International Conference on Information Systems (ICIS 2012)*, 3243-62. Volume 1. AIS/ICIS Administrative Office. <https://aisel.aisnet.org/icis2012/proceedings/EconomicsValue/9>.
- Cammaerts, Bart, and Nico Carpentier, eds. 2007. *Reclaiming the Media: Communication Rights and Democratic Media Roles*. 1st edition. Intellect. <https://doi.org/10.2307/j.ctv36xvqrf>.
- CNN Indonesia. 2021. "AJI: 3 Tahun Terakhir Ada 15 Jurnalis-Media Yang Dijerat UU ITE." *CNN Indonesia* (Jakarta), December 2, 2021. <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20211201151322-12-728525/aji-3-tahun-terakhir-ada-15-jurnalis-media-yang-dijerat-uu-ite>.
- Cole, Wade M. 2010. "No news is good news: Human rights coverage in the American print media, 1980-2000." *Journal of Human Rights* 9 (3): 303-25. DOI:10.1080/14754835.2010.501264.
- Creswell, John W. 2009. *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative and Mixed Methods Approaches*. Third Edition. SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Delfanti, Alessandro, and Adam Arvidsson. 2019. *Introduction to Digital Media*. Wiley Blackwell.

- Dolber, Brian, Michelle Rodino-Colocino, Chenjerai Kumanyika, and Todd Wolfson, eds. 2021. *The Gig Economy: Workers and Media in the Age of Convergence*. Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003140054>.
- Donahoe, Eileen. 2014. "Human Rights in the Digital Age." *Human Rights Watch*, December 23, 2014. <https://www.hrw.org/news/2014/12/23/human-rights-digital-age>.
- Emeraldien, Fikry Zahria, Rahma Sugihartati, and Titik Puji Rahayu. 2021. "Inaccuracy within online journalism in Indonesia." *Jurnal the Messenger* 13 (2): 179–193. <https://doi.org/10.26623/themessenger.v13i2.1011>.
- Esser, Frank, and Andrea Umbricht. 2014. "The evolution of objective and interpretative journalism in the Western press: Comparing six news systems since the 1960s." *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly* 91 (2): 229–49. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077699014527459>.
- Fernández Parrat, Sonia. 1998. "El reportaje en prensa: un género periodístico con futuro." *Revista Latina de Comunicación Social* 4: 1–7. <http://www.ull.es/publicaciones/latina/z8/r4absonia.htm>.
- GDP Venture. n.d. "GDP Venture." *GDP Venture*. Accessed July 31, 2025. <https://gdpventure.com/>.
- Hastjarjo, Sri. 2017. "Local journalism in the new media landscape: Opportunities and challenges." *KnE Social Sciences, The 3rd International Conference on Social and Political Science (ICoSapS)* 2: 21–27. <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v2i4.863>.
- Hayes, Arthur S., Jane B. Singer, and Jerry Ceppos. 2007. "Shifting roles, enduring values: The credible journalist in a Digital Age." *Journal of Mass Media Ethics* 22 (4): 262–79. <https://doi.org/10.1080/08900520701583545>.
- Hendrawan, Bram. 2013. "Televisi Lokal: Antara Kepentingan Korporat dan Fungsi Sosial." *Jurnal Komunikasi Indonesia* 2 (1): 5–14. <https://doi.org/10.7454/jki.v2i1.7825>.
- Hurcombe, Edward. 2024. "Conceptualizing the 'newsfluencer': Intersecting trajectories in online content creation and platformized journalism." *Digital Journalism* (September): 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21670812.2024.2397088>.
- Iyengar, Shanto. 1996. "Framing responsibility for political issues." *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science* 546 (1): 59–70. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0002716296546001006>.
- Juniarto, Damar. 2020. *Bangkitnya Ortoritarian Digital: Laporan Situasi Hak-hak Digital Indonesia 2019*. Denpasar: Southeast Asia Freedom of Expression Network (SAFENet). <https://safenet.or.id/wp-content/uploads/2020/10/Laporan-Situasi-Hak-Digital-Indonesia-2019.pdf>.
- Kern, Ina. 2024. "Investigation of the use of influencer strategies by the German public media sector: The Instagram channel News-WG, Migratöchter and Mädelsabende as a case study." MA Thesis, Sodertorn University.

- Komnas Perempuan. 2020. "Sejarah Komnas Perempuan." *Komnas Perempuan*. Accessed November 30, 2024. <https://komnasperempuan.go.id/sejarah>.
- Lestari, Rani Dwi, Ana Nadhya Abrar, and Md Shahidul Haque. 2024. "Collaborative newsroom of local journalists in investigative coverage on online media." *Komunikator* 16 (2): 29–41. <https://doi.org/10.18196/jkm.21655>.
- Lovering, J. 2009. "Fordism, Post-Fordism and flexible specialization." In *International Encyclopedia of Human Geography*, edited by Rob Kitchin and Nigel Thrift, 232–242. Elsevier. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-008044910-4.00213-3>.
- Mancini, Paolo. 2020. "Comparing media systems and the Digital Age." *International Journal of Communication* 14: 5761–74. <https://ijoc.org/index.php/ijoc/article/view/14553>.
- . 2022. "The process of de-institutionalization is the major consequence of Digital Revolution." *Medijska Istraživanja* 28 (2): 5–8. <https://hrcak.srce.hr/file/417815>.
- . 2023. "Features of the Digital Era: Deinstitutionalization and reinstitutionalization." In *Streamlining Political Communication Concepts*, edited by Susana Salgado, Stylianos Papathanassopoulos, 13–22. 1st edition. Springer Cham. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-031-45335-9_2.
- Mansell, Robin. 2009. "Power, media culture and new media." *Media Asia* 36 (3): 132–39. <https://doi.org/10.1080/23776277.2009.12224387>.
- Marín Arrese, Juana Isabel, and Begoña Núñez Perucha. 2006. "Evaluation and engagement in journalistic commentary and news reportage." Special Issue: Linguistics and the Media, *Revista Alicantina de Estudios Ingleses* 19 (November): 225–48. <https://doi.org/10.14198/raei.2006.19.13>.
- McNair, Brian. 2017. "After objectivity?: Schudson's sociology of journalism in the era of post-factuality." *Journalism Studies* 18 (10): 1318–33. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2017.1347893>.
- Mediana. 2024. "Kemenkominfo Tangani 111 Kasus Kebocoran Data Pribadi Sepanjang 2019-2024." *Kompas.id*, June 3, 2024. <https://www.kompas.id/baca/ekonomi/2024/06/03/111-kasus-kebocoran-data-pribadi-ditangani-kemenkominfo-pada-2019-14-mei-2024>.
- Morlandstø, Lisbeth, and Birgit Røe Mathisen. 2017. "Participation and control: The interactions between editorial staff, technology and users in online commentary journalism." *Digital Journalism* 5 (6): 791–808. <https://doi.org/10.1080/21670811.2016.1195133>.
- . 2022. "Podcast - Commentary journalism in a digital public." *Journalistica* 16 (1): 61–83. <https://doi.org/10.7146/journalistica.v16i1.128840>.
- Mujani, Saiful, and R. William Liddle. 2021. "Indonesia: Jokowi Sidelines Democracy." *Journal of Democracy* 32 (4): 72–86. <https://doi.org/10.1353/jod.2021.0053>.

- Nwankwo, Victoria Chioma. 2011. "The role of the media in promoting human rights: An analysis of the BBC Documentary, 'Chocolate: The Bitter Truth.'" MA thesis, University of Tromsø. <https://hdl.handle.net/10037/3500>.
- Oliver, Mary Beth, James Price Dillard, Keunmin Bae, and Daniel J. Tamul. 2012. "The effect of narrative news format on empathy for stigmatized groups." *Journalism & Mass Communication Quarterly* 89 (2): 205-24. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1077699012439020>.
- Ozgun, Aras. 2011. "Post-Fordism, neoliberalism and cultural production." In *Intersections: Practices of Curating, Education and Theory*, edited by Angela Harutyunyan, 33-48. 1st edition. AICA-Armenia, Institute of Contemporary Art.
- Peksen, Dursun, Timothy M. Peterson, and A. Cooper Drury. 2014. "Media-driven humanitarianism? News media coverage of human rights abuses and the use of economic sanctions." *International Studies Quarterly* 58 (4): 855-66. <https://www.jstor.org/stable/43868831>.
- Purba, Arta Elisabeth. 2019. "Intoleransi Istimewa, Pelanggaran HAM d(Ar)i Yogyakarta." <http://realino.usd.ac.id/realinoused/intoleransi-istimewa-pelanggaran-ham-dari-yogyakarta>.
- Rachelita, Yosephine Laura, and Lukas S. Ispandriarno. 2014. "Fungsi Media Massa Lokal Sebagai Perwarisan Nilai Budaya (Analisis Isi Fungsi Pewarisan Nilai Budaya Dalam Berita Pahargyan Ageng GKR Hayu dan KPH Notonegoro di SKH Kedaulatan Rakyat Periode 13 Agustus-27 Oktober 2013)." Universitas Atmajaya Yogyakarta. <https://e-journal.uajy.ac.id/6570/1/Jurnal.pdf>.
- Ramos, Howard, James Ron, and Oskar N. T. Thoms. 2007. "Shaping the Northern Media's human rights coverage, 1986-2000." *Journal of Peace Research* 44 (4): 385-406. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022343307078943>.
- Ri'aeni, Ida, and Widia Sulistiana. 2018. "Industri Media Massa Lokal dalam Tinjauan Manajemen Media Ideal." *JIKE: Jurnal Ilmu Komunikasi Efek* 1 (1): 265277. <https://doi.org/10.32534/jike.v1i1.51>.
- Rijaluzaman, Dananjaya. 2017. "Yogyakarta students give back through integrated learning." *The Jakarta Post*, July 17, 2017. <https://www.thejakartapost.com/life/2017/07/17/yogyakarta-students-give-back-through-integrated-learning.html>.
- Riyanto, Geger. 2024. *Understanding Homeless Media: A Study on Social Media Based Informal Local News in Five Indonesian Cities 2024*. Remotivi.
- Schreier, Margrit. 2012. *Qualitative Content Analysis in Practice*. 1st edition. SAGE Publications Ltd. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781529682571>.
- Sen, A. Fulya. 2015. "Communication and human rights." *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences* 174 (February): 2813-17. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2015.01.972>.

- Syobah, Sy Nurul, and Sabiruddin Sabiruddin. 2022. "Ekonomi Politik Media Lokal (Framing Pemberitaan Pelanggaran HAM Di Kalimantan Timur)." *Jurnal Lensa Mutiara Komunikasi* 6 (1): 116-126. <https://doi.org/10.51544/jlmk.v6i1.2349>.
- Tribunnews. 2025. "About us." [Tribunnews.com](https://www.tribunnews.com/). Accessed July 31, 2025.
- Wald, Dara M., Erik W. Johnston, Ned Wellman, and John Harlow. 2021. "How does personalization in news stories influence intentions to help with drought? Assessing the influence of state empathy and its antecedents." *Frontiers in Communication* 5 : 1-12. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fcomm.2020.588978>.
- Yanto, Syahrul Hidayanto, Wahyu Hamdani Haerudin, Guntur Freddy Prisanto, and Niken Febrina Ernungtyas. 2020. "Media Lokal dalam Proses Demokratisasi: Agen Politik atau Saluran Komunikasi Politik?" *Komunida: Media Komunikasi dan Dakwah* 10 (2): 159-174. <https://ejurnal.iainpare.ac.id/index.php/komunida/article/view/1586>.
- Yustitia, Senja, Nunung Prajarto, and Budi Irawanto. 2023. "Media irritability: Exploration of human rights issues in Indonesia during 2009-2019." *Jurnal Komunikasi: Malaysian Journal of Communication* 39 (2): 37-54. <https://doi.org/10.17576/JKMJC-2023-3902-03>.
- Yusuf, Iwan Awaluddin. 2011. "Media Lokal dalam Konstelasi Komunikasi Politik di Daerah." *Jurnal Ilmu Sosial dan Ilmu Politik* 14 (3): 297-315. <https://journal.ugm.ac.id/jsp/article/view/10930>.
- Zhou, Shuo, and Jeff Niederdeppe. 2017. "The promises and pitfalls of personalization in narratives to promote social change." *Communication Monographs* 84 (3): 319-342. DOI:10.1080/03637751.2016.1246348.

DR. SENJA YUSTITIA is a communication science researcher concerned with journalism and humanitarian issues. She is the current Head of the Master of Media and Communication Study Program at the Graduate School of Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta (UMY). She also spends part of her time writing popular media and political articles. <senja.yustitia@umy.ac.id>

FIRLY ANNISA, PHD serves as the Vice Dean in Academic and Student Affairs, Faculty of Social and Politics, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta (UMY). Her research areas include digital media culture, post-feminism, and internet celebrity studies. In 2023, she received a fellowship at The Walter Cronkite School for Journalism and Mass Communication at Arizona State University, US. <firlyannisa@umy.ac.id>